श्री अजीत जोगी: मान्यवर, शासन बारम्बार यह कहता है कि समस्या गंभीर है और इस को सर्वोच्च प्राथमिकता दी जा रही है। मैं यह जानना चाहूंगा कि क्या यह सच है कि परिवार कल्याण के कामों के लिए बजट में अभी तक किसी भी वर्ष एक प्रतिशत से अधिक राशि खर्च नहीं की गयी है ? अगर हम उसे सर्वोच्च प्राथमिकता दे रहे हैं और इतनी गंभीर समस्या मान रहे हैं तो क्या एक प्रतिशत की राशि शासन पर्याप्त मानता है? मैं यह भी जानना चाहूंगा कि जिस तरह से अभी तक परिवार कल्याण कार्यक्रम पारम्परिक साधनों को अपनाते हुए चलाया गया है क्या उसमें परिवर्तन कर आदिवासी अंचलों में जिस प्रकार पारम्परिक रूप से परिवार कल्याण के लिए जड़ी-बूटियों और दूसरे साधनों का प्रयोग किया जाता है, क्या उस पर कोई अनुसंधान किया गया है और उन्हें फैलाने के कोई उपाय भी किए जा रहे हैं?

MR. CHAIRMAN : He is talking about the *adivasis*. Will you find out about them and carry on research in that regard? This is the question. You say 'Yes'. (*Interruptions*) He comes from Orissa. He knows about the tribal areas. He had been the Chief Minister of that State also. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY: Sir, in tribal areas...(*Interruptions*) we are laying stress on education. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Sir, on a point of order. It is highly irregular for you to suggest the answer to him. It is on record. Please take it off the record. It will create a very bad impression. (*Interruptions*) This is not a National Front Government. This is a National Flop Government.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Sir, under which rule are you authorised to educate the Minister? You are not. You have only to see that the House works properly. You do not come in otherwise. Let them reply or let them not reply. You should not do it. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI AJIT P. K. JOGI : Sir, you are putting the answer in his mouth. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY: Sir, to control the rising population, the Government is determined to take various steps. Specially, we are laying stress on education.

MR. CHAIRMAN : He is talking about the *adivasis*.

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY : In the tribal areas also, we are laying special stress on educatin g the people.

SHRI AJIT P. K. JOGI : No. That was not my question. (*Interruptions*) माननीय यह मेरा प्रश्न नहीं था ।

श्री सभापति : मैंने आपका प्रश्न तीन बार कह दिया। बात खतम हो गई।

Question No. 83 (*Interruptions*)

Enquiry into the death due to AIDS of a diplomat from Zimbabwe

*83. SHRI MOHINDER SINGH LATHER :†
SHRI ISH DUTT YADAV :

Will the Minister of HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE be pleased to state :

(a) whether it is a fact that a diplomat from Zimbabwe who died in AIIMS recently has been tested HIV positive ;

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Mohinder Singh Lather.

(b) whether it is also a fact that this was kept a secret from the Lady Hardinge Medical College where the body was sent for embalming ;

(c) if so, whether Government have made any inquiry into the matter ; and

(d) if so, what is the result thereof and what action has been taken thereon?

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY) : (a) The patient who died in All India Institute of Medical Sciences was not a Zimbabian diplomat. However, a Zambian diplomat was admitted at AIIMS on 2nd January, 1990. He was also tested for HIV and found positive. The death of the patient occurred at AIIMS, New Delhi on 20th January, 1990.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Mr. Minister, now that you are reading it, it is all right. But I would request the Government. This is not the normal practice. The answer runs into almost three pages. In such cases, the normal practice is that the answer is laid on the Table of the House in the form of a statement. I hope, in future, the Government will ensure it. *(Interruptions)* I hope, in future, every Minister will take care of it. I do not like to impose this on the Secretariat. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Sir, your remark tantamounts to a censure of the Government. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Sir, the answer runs into three pages. But it has not been circulated. How can we ask anything?

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is why I have said that in future it should be laid on the Table of the House. This time, I have permitted him to read it.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : How can we ask supplementaries ?

MR. CHAIRMAN : I have said that in future it should be laid on the Table of the House so that it can be circulated. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Sir, is he going to read all the three pages ? It will go up to twelve and there will not be any time left to put supplementaries. *(Interruptions)*.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I have asked the Government to be careful. I have told them that this is not the normal practice. When the answer is long, it should be laid on the Table of the House, *(Interruptions)*. If I ask him to stop, you will say that there is no reply and, therefore, you cannot put any supplementaries. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Sir, this will go up to 12 O'clock. We cannot ask any clarifications.

MR. CHAIRMAN : What is your suggestion ?

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : My suggestion is that . . . *(Interruptions)*.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : सभापति जी, विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह जी की सरकार में मिनिस्टर न तो प्रश्न समझते हैं, न उत्तर दे पाते हैं और सदन को कन्फ्यूज करते हैं। तो ऐसे लोगों के लिए ट्रेनिंग सेण्टर खोला जाये, उसके बाद मिनिस्टर बनाया जाये। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY : (b) No, Sir. The procedures laid down at AIIMS internally for dealing with HIV positive cases had been followed regarding labelling and storage of the body in the mortuary. However, when the body was brought to the Lady Hardinge Medical College for embalming on 21st

January, 1990, the labels indicating that the patient was 'HIV positive-please handle carefully were not there. The All India Institute of Medical Sciences authorities did not send the body for embalming to Lady Hardinge Medical College. The body was taken by the relatives of the deceased to Lady Hardinge Medical College for embalming. Lady Hardinge Medical College, wihch provides facility for embalming. accepted the body on the basis of the request letter from the Zambian High Commission.

(c) and (d) In accordance with the established procedures an internal enquiry was conducted by the Head of the Department of Microbiology, AIIMS, who is also responsible for infection control. Thereafter, under the directions of the Minister, the Director General of Health Services ascertained the facts and submitted a report on the incident. The report reveals that there was no negligence on the part of doctors either at AIIMS or Lady Hardinge Medical College.

The All India Institute of Medical Sciences is ...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : There should be half-an-Hour discussion on this. Let there be a workshop for new Ministers.

MR. CHAIRMAN : If you had not disturbed, he would have finished by now.

SHRI M. M. JACOB : The Minister can give a summary in one minute. (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : We can ask supplementaries without that answer.

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY : The All India Institute of Medical Sciences is conducting an internal review of hospital infection control measures in order to reassure health staff that adequate provisions have been made for containing transmission of infectious diseases including AIDS.

The Director General of Health Services has reviewed the infection control measures with the Medical Superintendents of major hospitals in the country with the view to formulate guidelines and suggesting procedures for infection control.

The Directorate General of Health Services is also examining the existing guidelines and procedures for management of AIDS cases and associated arrangements for handling and disposal of deadbodies.

SHRI MOHINDER SINGH LATHER : I would like to know, when round the clock facilities for embalming are available in the All-India Institute of Medical Sciences, why was the body brought to the Lady Hardinge Medical College, especially when the body was of a foreign dignitary?

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY : The body of the High Commission diplomat was taken to the Lady Hardinge Medical College by the relatives of the deceased because though there was embalming procedure also in the All-India Institute of Medical Sciences in the Anatomy Department, when they approached the Anatomy Department, they were asked to produce certain papers relating to death certificate, police report, etc, So, they changed their mind the next day and approached the Anatomy Department of the Institute...And they took away the body from the mortuary.

MR. CHAIRMAN : And the other hospital did notr equire them to submit those documents.

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY : Yes, the other hospital...

THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING AND PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI P. UPENDRA): Sir, you are also putting a supplementary.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Sir, this should be an in camera session of Parliament. We cannot afford the others to hear and see this.

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY : Sir, thereafter it was taken to the Lady Hardinge Medical College and there it was embalmed.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Were the documents there?

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY : The letter of the relatives of the High Commissioner was addressed to the All India Institute of Medical Sciences and in its place, "Lady Hardinge Medical College" was inserted. Therefore they accepted the body and embalmed it.

SHRI MOHINDER SINGH LATHER : Sir, my second supplementary is that the Resident Doctors Association of All India Institute of Medical Sciences has rejected the inquiry report. They have said that this is only a white-wash and cover up to save the guilty persons from the charge of negligence and carelessness. I would like to know from the Minister whether the Association has requested for institution of another enquiry by experts from outside the Medical Institute and whether the Government will order a fresh enquiry as demanded by the doctors of the Association.

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY : This is a specific question. I want notice.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : Sir, let him do his home work and come.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : Sir, this is the prompting that he has got. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY : Sir, the Director-General of Health Services and certain senior medical officers of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences have enquired into it and submitted a report. On the basis of that report, I have given my reply. I have no knowledge about any specific demand from any quarter to institute another enquiry.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Subramanian Swamy.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Sir, since there is no hope of getting an answer to my supplementary, I withdraw my request.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Sir, I did not really understand the details of what was said, but from the previous supplementary which was raised, it is obvious that certain documents were needed for the process of embalming to be done in a government hospital. The Minister has said that the body was taken away from one place because the documents were demanded and it was taken to another place, where it was done. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether it is a fact that in the second hospital documents were not required to be submitted for the process of embalming, in which case you have different rules for different government hospitals in Delhi. I would like to know whether there are different rules in the two hospitals in Delhi for getting bodies embalmed—in one, one must have documents and in the other one does not require them.

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY : In the Lady Hardinge Medical College, they require only the death slip and the request from the High Commission office for embalming the body.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : That is not my question.

MR. CHAIRMAN : He has given the answer. In the Medical Institute, they require these, here they do not require these. You can draw your own conclusion.

SHRI P. UPENDRA : If they have got such divergent rules, these were framed by the previous Government.

SHRI M. M. JACOB : That is no answer, Mr. Upendra. You give the answer, otherwise keep quiet.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Please, Sir, you must protect me. I am saying, is it a fact that there are different sets of rules for getting bodies embalmed in different government hospitals in Delhi? Let him say, 'yes' or 'no' Are there uniform rules?

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY : I want notice for this.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Was the diplomat dead or alive when he was brought ? Does he need notice for that also?..... ....(*Interruptions*).....

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I hope the Minister is conscious of the seriousness of the issue, because this is not the first time that such an incident has taken place at the All-India Institute of Medical Sciences. I would like to know from the honourable Minister as to what guidelines have been given by his Ministry to deal with such cases in future, and what action has been taken so far. Last year Sir in this month, hundreds of people received HIV positive immunoglobulin injection from the All-India Institute of Medical Sciences, and we were assured of action. Now this incident has taken place in that the instruments which were used for treating this diplomat were not sterilized. There have been allegations from the doctors and nurses and that the same instruments were also used on other patients. Have any steps been taken....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Mr. Arif Mohd. Khan ha brought the written answer for him. ....(*Interruptions*).....

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I have not finished.....(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is joint Cabinet responsibility, you know.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: This is a new definition of collective responsibility.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA : Sir, the way things are, through you I would like to suggest to the Government that they should have some alert Ministers because AIDS is a very serious disease.....(*Interruptions*).....It is not possible for him to deal with it.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Sir they should be allowed official "runners." Last week also, when the Tau came, he also needed a runner. Some junior Ministers must be alert to answer this question.

MR. CHAIRMAN: A Cabinet Minister is helping him. What is the harm?....(*Interruptions*).....

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY: Sir, this is a case...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Sir, neighbour should not be allowed to "aid" him?.....(*Interruptions*).....

SHRI NILAMANI ROUTRAY: Sir so far as this case is concerned, it is for the first time that it happened in the All-India Institute of Medical Sciences. We are trying to look into how, hereafter, infection should be controlled, how the people who are working there should not be affected. Such guidelines have been framed and the guidelines are also being discussed with the top doctors to see how there can be a fullproof arrangement against such contamination or infection.

*84. [*Transferred to the 22nd March, 1990*].